

The Inter-Religious Plurality of Scriptures in Asia and the Intra-Religious Plurality of Psalter Editions in Early Judaism

Dorothea Erbele-Küster*

The understanding of the biblical canon as a stable and fixed collection of books from the very beginning has become questioned by the investigations on the historical shape and arrangement¹⁾ of the Bible editions, last but not least by the discoveries in Qumran research.²⁾ The distinction between two aspects of the term canon is helpful in this discussion: One may distinguish between canon as norm, standard, rule (*norma normans*) and canon as fixed catalogue, register, list (*norma normata*).³⁾ It will become

* prof., The Faculty of Protestant Theology in Brussels, dept. of the Old Testament

1) Erich Zenger, "Der Psalter im Horizont von Tora und Prophetie.

Kanongeschichtliche und kanonhermeneutische Perspektiven," Jean Marie Auwers and Henk Jan de Jonge, eds., *The Biblical Canons*, BETHL CLXIII (Leuven: Peeters, 2003), 111-134. highlighting the position of the Psalter in different canonical lists from the 5th to 10th century CE that not only the content but as well the ordering of the books are important for the interpretation.

2) Cf. Eugen Ulrich, *The Dead Sea Scrolls and the Origins of the Bible* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999); Peter W. Flint, *The Dead Sea Psalms Scrolls and the Book of Psalms*, STDJ 17 (Leiden/New York/Köln: Brill, 1997).

3) Cf. James Sanders, "Art. Canon," *ABD* I (London/New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992), 839; Gerald T. Sheppard, "Art. Canon," *ER* 3 (1987), 62-69, 64-65. distinguishes as well between two uses: canon as rule, ideal, norm (1) and canon as fixed list, register, catalog (2) Jan Assmann labels the first, "das heiligende Prinzip" and the second "der geheiligte Bestand" [cf. Jan Assmann, *Das kulturelle*

obvious that canon as well as Bible and biblical texts are an anachronistic nomenclature for Early Judaism.

In Asia Christians face likewise a plurality of scriptures, however an inter-religious plurality: Buddhist⁴⁾, Confucianist, Daoist and Hinduist. The very way how the Asian scholar Kwok Pui-lan, born and raised in China, living in the U.S.,⁵⁾ deals with this situation will be examined in a first step⁽¹⁾. Pui-lan has developed a hermeneutical model which tries to understand the canon of the Christians, the Bible, from within an Asian (diasporic) perspective. Challenged by this multiscriptural context it can be useful to look back to Ancient Judaism of the beginning of the first century CE. At this moment scripture was not yet a clearly defined body of holy books and a plurality of different editions of one “biblical” book existed. Therefore in part two the Intra-Religious⁶⁾ plurality of Psalter editions of the pre-masoretic text, the Septuagint and the Psalm scroll 11QPs^a found in Qumran will be investigated. This plurality of Psalter editions in the first century CE has initialized a discussion on the common conceptions of canon⁽²⁾.⁷⁾

Gedächtnis: Schrift, Erinnerung und politische Identität in frühen Hochkulturen (München: Beck 1992), 115].

- 4) Already within Buddhism there exists an (Intra-Religious) plurality of important Buddhist writings in Pali, Sanskrit, Chinese and other Asian languages.
- 5) Kwok Pui-lan was born 1952 and grew up in Hong Kong. Since 1984 she lives mostly in the U. S. Just after her graduation in 1989 at Harvard Divinity School in Boston she went back for a short period to her Alma Mater, the Chinese University in her hometown, Hong Kong. Since then she teaches at the Episcopal Divinity School in Boston/Massachusetts. At the moment(2010) she is president-elect of AAR(American Academy of Religion).
- 6) My focus will be on a certain historical time period among the Jewish traditions from about 150 BCE till the first century CE, thus a time of Intra-Religious plurality. However, the early Christian communities descending from Jewish background have had to face this phenomenon as well.
- 7) Cf. the second proposition of Heinz-Josef Fabry, “Le Texte de la Bible à Qumran. L’Exemple du Rouleau des Psaumes,” Adrian Schenker, éd., *L’enfance de la bible*

Finally the reinterpretation of the Intra-Religious plurality in the light of the inter-religious plurality and vice versa may clarify the issue of canon in interreligious dialogue as in the general hermeneutical discussions(3).⁸⁾

1. Reading the Biblical Canon in midst an Inter-Religious Plurality of Scriptures in Asia

*Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*⁹⁾ is the programmatic title of Kwok Pui-lan's book on hermeneutics in 1995. "Non-biblical world" refers to the multi religious contexts in Asia. Christians are in an absolute minority situation;¹⁰⁾ in her homeland China they count less than 5%. With regards to the plurality of holy scriptures in Asia and to the long tradition of hermeneutics in Asia Christians are asked to question their western conception of truth and hermeneutics. In Buddhist Literature the coexistence of conflicting sources and concepts

hébraïque. L'histoire du texte de L'Ancien Testament à la lumière des recherches récentes (Labor et Fides: Geneve, 2005), 132-147, 135.

- 8) Cf. for an earlier version: L. NAGY, "Reconsidering the Issue of the Canon: the Intra-Religious Plurality of Scriptures in Asia and the Intra-Religious Plurality of Psalter Editions (MT, LXX, Qumran)," *Studia Theologia Catholica Latina* 2 (Cluj-Napoca: Cluj University Press, 2005), 19-28.
- 9) Cf. Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World* (Maryknoll: Orbis, 1995). Ten years later with her book *Postcolonial Imagination and Feminist Theology* (Louisville/Kentucky: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005). a shift of emphasis is marked. Whereas she underscored first the intra-Asian plurality of scriptures as a Chinese Christian, Kwok is now more preoccupied with the postcolonial reading of the Bible in her Diaspora situation.
- 10) This is different in the country where the journal appears. Statistics say that around a quarter to a third of the population belongs to Christianity; however South Korea is a multireligious society[cf. Volker Küster, *A Protestant Theology of Passion: Korean Minjung Theology Revisited* (Leiden: Brill, 2010)].

of authority generates a “hermeneutic pluralism.”¹¹⁾ Kwok Pui-lan herself is a wanderer in-between cultures and religions.¹²⁾

1.1. The Bible as Common and as Asian Heritage

In an early statement Kwok underlines the ecumenical importance of the Bible:

Those post-Christian feminists who try to move away from the biblical religion...tend to alienate themselves from global sisterhood because the Bible is an important part of our common “heritage” and “language” cutting across cultural and socio-political diversities.¹³⁾

The Bible is the common tradition which people from different contexts share with each other and which makes consequently dialogue or community possible. Even though some texts are oppressive, Kwok does not abandon or reject the Bible generally due to its patriarchal character. At the same time she claims the Bible as Asian heritage:

In particular, I cannot believe that truth is only revealed in a book written almost two thousands years ago, and

11) Luis O. Gomez, “Art. Buddhist Literature: Exegesis and Hermeneutics,” *ER* 2 (1987), 529-540, 529, 533.

12) Ten years ago she described her identity as “a Chinese feminist intellectual in diaspora in the U. S” (letter to the author from 11th of October 1999). In her book *Postcolonial Imagination*, 50 some years later she speaks of herself as “a Chinese in dispora.”

13) Kwok Pui-lan, “The Feminist Hermeneutics of Elisabeth Schuessler Fiorenza: An Asian Feminist Response,” *EAJT* 3 (1985), 147-153, 148. The Korean scholar Young-sil Choi underlines the importance of the canonical status of the Bible for Korean feminist theology in his article: Young-sil Choi, “A Model of New Testament Hermeneutics in the experience of Korean women,” *Madang: Journal of Contextual Theology in East Asia* 1 (2004), 69-84, 70, 76.

that the Chinese have no way to participate in its inception.¹⁴⁾

Truth is not a metaphysical given data to which we may refer universally; it becomes for Kwok Pui-lan lucid in the concrete struggle for liberty in people's lives. This quotation confronts at the same time the western view of the Bible which is rooted in western culture and history.

1.2. Postcolonial Reading of the Bible¹⁵⁾

The aim of Kwok's postcolonial reading is to discover the Bible with Asian eyes beyond the western perspective. In her interpretation of the Syrophenician women in Matthew 15:2-28 // Marc 7:24-30 she unmasks the misuse of this text. According to an anti judaistic salvation history model the text served in mission history often as model for submissive conversion. As Asian woman, for Kwok the way the Gentile woman addresses Jesus and vice versa is of utmost interest.¹⁶⁾ In the story the pagan woman begs Jesus to cast out the demon of her daughter. The narrative consists of a web of differences like: Jewish homeland/foreign land, inside/outside, Jewish/Gentiles, women/disciples. Otherness is highlighted in multiple ways: the other as woman, as pagan etc. Instead of assuming that the Syrophenician woman became a Christian, Kwok states that in the Gospel the cultural and religious identity of the woman is respected. Her re-reading gives impulses for multifaith hermeneutics and facilitates interreligious dialogue. Thus Bible studies

14) Kwok Pui-lan, "Mothers and Daughters. Writers and Fighters," Letty M. Russell, et. al., eds., *Inheriting our Mother's Gardens: Feminist Theology in Third World Perspective* (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1988), 21-34, 29-30.

15) Cf. Kwok Pui-lan, *Postcolonial Imagination and Feminist Theology* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005).

16) Cf. Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 71-83.

have to discover the complex interactions between cultures in the Bible itself.¹⁷⁾

1.3. Biblical interpretation as dialogical imagination¹⁸⁾

As an Asian Christian theologian she tries to bring into dialogue two different stories: the Biblical story and the Asian story.¹⁹⁾ Hence two acts of imagination have to be undergone: First how the ancient/biblical world was and second how the Bible may address the questions of contemporary Asia. Thus Kwok questions the biblical stories whether they may for example shed light on the massacre of the Chinese students. On the 5 of June 1989 thousands of them lost their lives in the struggle for freedom and democracy. But not only has the Bible interpreted the Asian history it is as well the other way round: The courage of the young people in the resistance movement reveals the reality of resurrection. The Theologian wants to “re-write the script and re-cast the biblical drama, giving women more active roles.”²⁰⁾

In this process of re-writing and re-telling the biblical salvation history, both the Asian myths and stories and the biblical stories get intertwined. Kwok wants to overcome a hierarchical distinction between text and context, or between the biblical

17) Cf. Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 91, 94.

18) Cf. Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 12. There is a shift nowadays Postcolonial Imagination is the umbrella term which encompasses Historical, Dialogical and Diasporic imagination(Kwok Pui-lan, *Postcolonial Imagination and Feminist Theology*).

19) For a dialogical imagination between Taoism/Buddhism and the Biblical creation story as an mode of inter-religious dialogue cf. Euyun-kyu, Kim, “Life and Ecological Ideas in Genesis Chapter 1: A View from Taoism and Buddhism,” *Madang: Journal of Contextual Theology in East Asia* 1 (2004), 85-112.

20) Kwok Pui-lan, “Reflection on Women’s Sacred Scriptures,” *Concilium* 3 (1998), 105-112, 109.

text and other texts. Consequently text as scripture is not silent but a “talking book”²¹⁾, underlining the revelatory power. This dialogical model of interpretation presupposes that the Bible is endowed with a plurality of meanings and of voices.

1.4. Oral Hermeneutics of Asian (Wo)men

In the process of dialogical imagination the oral tradition is taken seriously. Her method of dialogical interpretation is inspired by the way scriptures are dealt with in the Asian context she grew up in.²²⁾ The Vedas of the Hindu tradition have been transmitted long time orally. Buddhist sutras give an account of the words spoken by Buddha. Confucius’ Analects of conversations with his pupils were later collected and written down. Just like in the early beginnings of the New Testament the written text was not the starting point, but the gospel which was preached.

Kwok strives to go beyond relating the oral to the written tradition. She tries hence to proclaim a new model of scripture including as well non-written forms. Although the interpretation process of these texts was often dominated by males, Kwok takes Asian myths and stories told by women to interpret the Bible.²³⁾

1.5. From Indigenization towards Multifaith Hermeneutics

21) Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 40.

22) Traces of orality are not only found in Asian religions, this phenomenon occurs as well in Abrahamic religions: The Hebrew Bible knows not only the *ketib*, the written version, but also the *qere*, how it should be read.

23) Cf. Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, IX: “When women study the Bible, we do not read from a written text. Instead, we share our stories, songs, and dreams.”

Indigenization seems for Kwok to be obsolete, since it was often misused in mission history.²⁴⁾ Indigenization takes a universal kernel or truth for granted, which could be wrapped in different cultural fashions, whereas Kwok opts for a dialogical model, in which text and context are interchangeable and equivalent.

Since her context is multireligious this changes completely the reading of the Bible. Differences are not annihilated and tensions are taken as challenge. Interreligious dialogue ethics imply that the other acknowledges our description of his/her faith as compatible with his/her self-understanding.²⁵⁾ However her strive goes even further:

The Bible must also be read from the perspective of other faith traditions. Multifaith hermeneutics looks at ourselves as others see us, so that we may be able to see ourselves more clearly.²⁶⁾

One of the most difficult challenges for multifaith hermeneutics is probably to see the Bible with the lens of other religions and cultures, thus to be interpreted by the other.²⁷⁾

2. Reconsidering the Issue of Canon from an Intra-Religious Plurality of Psalter Editions

The dialogical model described by Kwok Pui-lan which

24) Cf. Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 57-58, 65.

25) Cf. Volker Küster, "Art. Dialog," *RGGA* 2 (1999), 821.

26) Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 92.

27) Cf. Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 58: "Multifaith hermeneutics requires us to affirm that other religious traditions are as valid as Christianity."

weaves text and context together is already intrinsic to the Bible itself. This presupposition will be explained by taking the Psalter editions of the Hebrew Bible, of the Septuagint and from Qumran as examples. The contextuality of each edition will become evident. It has to be stated that the Psalter editions found in Qumran are fragmentary-in a very material sense.²⁸⁾ We have not found a manuscript which attests the entire masoretic Psalter and for several Psalms we have no evidence.²⁹⁾ However among the biblical texts found in Qumran the quantity of Psalter editions (fragments of it) is next to the Pentateuch one of the highest.³⁰⁾ The most striking manuscript is Psalm scroll 11QPs^{a31)} which compasses besides of 39 Psalms known from the masoretic text of the two last psalm books compositions unknown from it. Even regarding the outer appearance the scroll is special.³²⁾ In addition the sequence of the Psalms differs from the one of the Hebrew Masoretic and the Greek Psalter. The character of the Psalter scrolls found in Qumran is disputed. For some the findings in Qumran reflect a major step in the

28) Cf. the stress which is laid on the difficult material state of the scrolls by Eva Jain and Annette Steudel, "Les manuscrites psalmiques de la Mer Morte et la réception du Psautier à Qumran," *RevSR* 77:4 (2003), 529-543.

29) Cf. Heinz-Josef Fabry, "Le Texte de la Bible à Qumran. L'Exemple du Rouleau des Psaumes," 136-137.

30) Cf. Heinz-Josef Fabry, "Le Texte de la Bible à Qumran L'Exemple du Rouleau des Psaumes," 135-136.

31) For an overview of the discussion on the scroll in Korean language cf. Jungwoo Kim, "The Qumran Psalms and the Canonical Implications of the Differences in Editorial arrangement of Psalms in 11QPs^a(in Korean)," 「Canon&Culture」 1:2 (2008), 89-120. He tends to interpret 11QPs^a as an edition for liturgical purposes.

32) Emanuel Tov, "The Writing of Ancient Biblical Texts, with Special Attention to the Judean Desert Scrolls," Chaim Cohen, et al., eds., *Sefer Moshe: The Moshe Weinfeld Jubilee Volume* (Winona Lake/Indiana: Eisenbrauns 2004), 445-458, 455. labels 11QPs^a a "deluxe edition" due to its format with large-size top and bottom margins.

process of canonization of the Psalter. They understand 11QPs^a as canonical, whereas others plea for a library edition or a scroll composed for liturgical use.

In what follows different Psalter editions will be investigated to discover the potentiality within (intra-) the Jewish-Christian Tradition for the development of inter-religious hermeneutics. The argument is thus based on one biblical book, a unique one. One could object whether one may make an argument on the canon just on the basis of one book; however it is a widespread book not only within Qumran and in its exemplariness it opens up the idea of canon.

2.1. Canon as list (norma normata): Ps 151 LXX as a supernumerary Psalm³³⁾

Unlike the Masoretic Psalter which ends with Ps 150, in the Septuagint the Davidic autobiographical Psalm 151 is added. The first verse argues in an apologetic way. It reads “written by himself and a supernumerary Psalm.” This quotation reflects that the Septuagint Psalter knows about a usual edition with just 150 Psalms. Anyhow the editors trespass this number consciously by including a surplus Psalm in their canonical Greek edition. Ps 151 LXX brings in new aspects to the characterization of David, idealizing him. David is associated with a lyre and is described in Hellenistic terms alluding Orpheus.³⁴⁾

The biographical Ps 151 of the Septuagint is as well trans-

33) Cf. Dorothea Erbele-Küster, *Lesen als Akt des Betens. Eine Rezeptionsästhetik der Psalmen*, WMANT 87 (Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchner Verlagshaus, 2001), 97-103.

34) Erich Zenger, “Der Psalter im Horizont von Tora und Prophetie. Kanongeschichtliche und kanonhermeneutische Perspektiven,” 132-134. emphasizes that the Psalter undergoes a prophetic-eschatological interpretation by Psalm 151.

mitted in a Hebrew version found in Qumran, which served probably as model for the Greek one. Ps 151 LXX is an intertextual conflate-reading of the Hebrew qumranic Ps 151A and B. The Septuagint as translation for the Jews living in the Diaspora was a precondition for communicating the faith in a changed historical situation which had to face the hellenized world. The Greek Psalter is an example for an edition referring to an existing normative scripture but nevertheless exceeding it.

2.2. David as a rule(norma normans) for 11QPs^a

11QPs^a, a Psalm scroll found in Cave 11 at Qumran, copied between 30-50 CE differs in arrangement and content from the (pre)masoretic Psalter. Most likely it begins with Ps 101. Ps 151A followed by Ps 151B stands at the end. The scroll includes as well unknown material such as the prose “David’s Composition” which says that David has composed 3600 Psalms, and all in all even 4050 songs. Consequently for 11QPs^a every Psalm that is written and/or read in the light of David is authoritative. The Davidic framework is taken as a sign for its authority.³⁵⁾ Because 11QPs^a takes the authorship and readership of David as an accepted fact, the line of the Greek version about the supernumerary status of the Psalm would not make sense. The function of “David’s Composition” could be described as “an authority-conferring strategy.”³⁶⁾ 11QPs^a has no

35) Cf. James S. Sanders, “The Qumran Psalms Scroll (11QPs^a),” *Discoveries in the Judaean Desert of Jordan 4* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1965); Reviewed, James S. Sanders, *On Language, Culture and Religion: In Honor of Eugen A. Nida* (The Hague: Mouton, 1974), 95-96 and James S. Sanders, “Variorum in the Psalms Scroll (11QPs^a),” *HTR* 59 (1966) 86-87.

36) Angela Kim, “Authorizing interpretation in poetic compositions in the Dead Sea scrolls and later Jewish and Christian traditions,” *Dead Sea Discoveries* 10:1 (2003),

need to count the Psalms, in order to draw a line of demarcation between the 150 ‘regular’ Psalms and other supernumerary, since anyhow it will not exceed the enormous number of 3600 or 4050 Psalms and songs. Therefore this Psalter stays open to oral tradition.

Intertextuality

Another way of linking up with other traditions blank spaces in the midst of the verse marked with the Hebrew letter *samech* and *pe*, the so called Pisqah Be’emsa ‘Pasuq (p.b.p.), signals openness for external voices or intertextual biblical reading. Shemaryahu Talmon argues that for example in I Sam 16:12, the election of David as king, the blank space could be filled or read together with Ps 151A of 11QPs^a.³⁷⁾ This implies that 11QPs^a belongs to the scriptures who can be read together with other canonical/biblical texts, as in other cases the p.b.p in the books of Samuel (II Sam 7:4) is expanded with a so-called canonical Psalm as Ps 132. The phenomenon of intertextuality could be understood as an argument for their use in the reading and interpretation process of narrative parts of the writings. Compositions such as Ps 151A and B in 11QPs^a hence were attested “a certain degree of popular authority, which might explain their inclusion in a canonical collection.”³⁸⁾ These blank spaces amidst the verses in ancient manuscripts of the Hebrew Bible open thus the text for further texts and voices.

26-58, 46. Available from: ATLA Religion Database with ATLA Serials, Ipswich, MA. Accessed September 15, 2010.

37) Cf. Shemaryahu Talmon, “Pisqah Be’emsa ‘Pasuq and 11QPs^a,” *Textus* 5 (1966), 11-21.

38) Cf. Gerald H. Wilson, “The Qumran Scroll Reconsidered: Analysis of the Debate,” *CBQ* 47 (1985), 624-642, 630.

2.3. David as hermeneutical key(norma normans)

The Davidic superscriptions in all Psalter editions alike serve as an initial aid and hermeneutical hint to re-read the Psalms in the light of the experiences of David. David serves as a first reader(*implied reader*) which facilitates ongoing reading processes.³⁹⁾ Using Davidic superscriptions embraces and fosters the oral transmission and at the same time it goes along with the stabilization and authorization of the written Psalter. In 11QPs^a a “true Davidic Psalter”⁴⁰⁾ has been created. Referring to these different Psalter editions makes clear that canon is historically shaped. Being canonical or not is depending on the community.

In attributing more and more Psalms to David in the Septuagint and Qumran editions the redactors have found a way to make the Psalms authoritative. Production and reception get interwoven. Producing, adding a Davidic superscription is at the same token a way of reading the psalms.⁴¹⁾ The confirmation that David is writing, praying and singing Psalms opens the text for new re-readings and re-castings.

3. Reconsidering the Issue of Canon

This concept of biblical scripture in the first century Common Era and its hermeneutical implications will now be confronted with the concept of scriptural authority in East Asia seen by a modern biblical scholar.

39) Cf. Dorothea Erbele-Küster, *Lesen als Akt des Betens*, 53-107.

40) Cf. Peter W. Flint, *The Dead Sea Psalms Scrolls and the Book of Psalms*, 224.

41) Heinz-Josef Fabry, “Le Texte de la Bible à Qumran L’Exemple du Rouleau des Psaumes,” 146-147.

3.1. Scripture between Fluidity and Stability

“Canon implies boundaries, which have significant consequences for interpretation and use. [...] Canon does not; however imply fixed or unchangeable boundaries.”⁴²⁾ It became obvious that canon as a term commonly used in the sense of a clearly shaped body of authoritative books(*norma normata*) is not appropriate with respect to the multiscriptural situation in Asia. Instead of speaking of canon Kwok prefers the term scripture in the plural and uses it just as rule(*norma normans*) but not as a fixed corpus. Speaking of scriptures does imply for her a plurality of sacred scriptures without regarding just one as authoritative. Likewise the term canon is imprecise with respect to Qumran,⁴³⁾ because the process of authorization and stabilization was still ongoing. The investigation on 11QPs^a revealed that the Psalter was at least for its last third part open in content and arrangement.⁴⁴⁾ Acknowledging this, the alternative of regarding 11QPs^a as a secondary scroll with liturgical purposes⁴⁵⁾ or as a canonical scroll becomes questioned. Kwok understands the Bible as an “open” book. The metaphor of “fluidity”⁴⁶⁾ underlines in both cases, the place of the Bible with-

42) Phyllis A. Bird, “The Authority of the Bible,” *NIB* I (1994) 33-64, 44.

43) Peter W. Flint, *The Dead Sea Psalms Scrolls and the Book of Psalms*, 24 does not use canon/canonical with reference to Qumran scrolls(cf. 13-26).

44) Cf. Peter W. Flint, “Of Psalms and Psalters: James Sanders’ Investigation of the Psalm Scrolls,” Richard D. Weiss and David M. Carr, eds., *A Gift of God in due season*, JSOTSS 225 (Sheffield: Sheffield Press, 1996), 65-83, 68.

45) According to Emanuel Tov, “The Contribution of the Different Groups of Biblical Dead Sea Scrolls to Exegesis,” 『Canon&Culture』 1:2 (2008), 11-39. “most Psalm scrolls from cave 4 and 11” belong to the group of so called “non aligned texts that are liturgical”(31).

46) Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 22 and James Sanders, “Art. Canon,” 847. Cf. Dominique Barthélémy, “L’État de la Bible Juive depuis le Début de notre Ère jusqu’à la deuxième révolte contre Rome(131-135),” Jean-

in the Asian context and the status of biblical books around the turn of the area, the processual character of the canonization and of the interpretation of the canon.

3.2. The quest for authority of the canon

David as author, reader and singer of the Psalms serves as *norma normans* in the process of authorization. It makes evident that the canon can be a productive concept. The canon opens up ways of interpretations. David as a canonical principle which is intrinsic to scripture makes it possible to include other voices and texts in the ongoing re-interpretation. The Asian theologian questions the sacrality and authority of the canon generally; she demands to demythologize and to deconstruct the Bible as canon.⁴⁷⁾ Unlike liberationist feminist theologians for whom the central message of the Bible is liberative, for Kwok the authority is rooted in the liberation process. She states:

The critical principle lies not in the Bible itself, but in the community of women and men who read the Bible and, through their dialogical imagination, appropriate it for their own liberation.⁴⁸⁾

Thus the concept of text shifts from scriptural text to a living texture and the authority of the scripture is dependent from the community. The readers may recognize the inner qualities of the text. It seems that in Kwok's dialogical model no

Daniel Kaestli and Otto Wermlinger, eds., *Le Canon de L'Ancien Testament: Sa Formation et son Histoire* (Geneva: Labor et Fides, 1984), 9-45, 19. dealing with Qumran states a "flou existant dans les frontières des Livres saints." Thus speaking as well of boundaries he combines fluidity of the canon with the category of an existing repertoire.

47) Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 30, 85.

48) Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 19.

qualitative difference between the text and the context exists. The text is no longer a static concept or as the Korean Theologian Chung-Yung Kyung puts it: “we are the text.”⁴⁹⁾

3.3. From Intra-Religious to Inter-religious Intertextuality

Intertextuality is a biblical phenomenon which goes already beyond the Hebrew Bible and can hence give insights for a general interreligious intertextuality. Taking Asian hermeneutical traditions into consideration Kwok strives for a “cross-textual”⁵⁰⁾ reading, where both texts, the Biblical text and the context, the cultural and religious text of the reader, are interwoven.

Conclusion: Towards an Intercultural Hermeneutics

Kwok Pui-lan’s methodology challenges common ways of dealing with the Bible. The task is to develop inter-religious hermeneutics which are compatible to Intra-Religious hermeneutics. The findings in Qumran challenge the traditional understanding of canon. “New”, “anonymous” hymns were incorporated into the collections “for the purpose of authorizing them for a particular community [This] seems to be a sign of the growing scripturalization of these texts.”⁵¹⁾ The process of

49) Chung Huyn Kyung, *Struggle to be the Sun again: Introducing Asian Women’s Theology* (New York: Maryknoll, 1990), 111: “The text of God’s revelation was, is, and will be written in our bodies and our peoples’ everyday struggle for survival and liberation...Our life is the text, and the Bible and church tradition are the context which sometimes becomes the reference for our own ongoing search for God.”

50) Cf. Kwok Pui-lan, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, 63. taking over a term coined by Archie Lee.

formation and stabilization of the canon bears witness of a plurality of editions. Facing this, the Septuagint scholar Kristin de Troyer asks the scholarly community: “Finally, why are we still looking for a single and uniform text?”⁵²⁾ The Intra-Religious plurality reflects the diversity of communities and the role the community plays for the authorization of the canon.⁵³⁾ We should be aware that the “method of composition of the Scripture is a process and that the process of the development of Scripture is dialectical-Scripture, which began as experience, was produced through a process of tradition(s) being formulated about that experience and being reformulated by interpreters in dialogue with the experience of their communities and with the larger culture.”⁵⁴⁾ Intercultural Exegesis as a hermeneutical tool, may contribute to create liminal rooms, which help to face other holy scriptures.

<주요어>

Qumran, Septuagint, intercultural hermeneutics, Asia, Scripture

<Key Words>

쿰란, 70인역, 문화상호간 해석학, 아시아, 경전, 성경

* Received September 30, 2010, Revised October 5, 2010, Accepted October 8, 2010.

51) Angela Kim, “Authorizing interpretation in poetic compositions in the Dead Sea scrolls and later Jewish and Christian traditions,” 58.

52) Kristin De Troyer, “Qumran research and textual studies: a different approach,” *Religious Studies Review* 28 (2002), 115-122, 121.

53) Cf. David M. Carr, “Canonization in the Context of Community,” Richard D. Weiss and David M. Carr, eds., *A Gift of God in Due Season*, JSOTSS 225 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1996), 22-64.

54) Eugen Ulrich, *The Dead Sea Scrolls and the Origins of the Bible*, 73-74 cited by Kristin De Troyer, “Qumran research and textual studies: a different approach,” 120.

References

- Assmann, Jan, *Das kulturelle Gedächtnis: Schrift, Erinnerung und politische Identität in frühen Hochkulturen*, München: Beck, 1992, 115.
- Barthélémy, Dominique, “L’État de la Bible Juive depuis le Début de notre Ère jusqu’à la deuxième révolte contre Rome(131-135),” Jean-Daniel Kaestli and Otto Wermlinger, eds., *Le Canon de L’Ancien Testament: Sa Formation et son Histoire*, Geneva: Labor et Fides, 1984, 9-45, 19.
- Carr, David M., “Canonization in the Context of Community,” Richard D. Weiss and David M. Carr, eds., *A Gift of God in Due Season*, JSOTSS 225, Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1996, 22-64.
- Choi, Young-sil, “A Model of New Testament Hermeneutics in the experience of Korean women,” *Madang: Journal of Contextual Theology in East Asia* 1 (2004), 69-84, 70, 76.
- Chung, Huyn Kyung, *Struggle to be the Sun again: Introducing Asian Women’s Theology*, New York: Maryknoll, 1990, 111.
- De Troyer, Kristin, “Qumran research and textual studies: a different approach,” *Religious Studies Review* 28 (2002), 115-122, 121.
- Erbele-Küster, Dorothea, *Lesen als Akt des Betens: Eine Rezeptionsästhetik der Psalmen*, WMANT 87, Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchner Verlagshaus, 2001, 97-103.
- Fabry, Heinz-Josef, “Le Texte de la Bible à Qumran. L’Exemple du Rouleau des Psaumes,” Adrian Schenker, ed., *L’enfance de la bible hébraïque: L’histoire du texte de L’Ancien Testament à la lumière des recherches récentes*, Labor et Fides: Geneve, 2005, 132-147, 135.
- Flint, Peter W., “Of Psalms and Psalters: James Sanders’ Investigation of the Psalm Scrolls,” Richard D. Weiss and David M. Carr, eds., *A Gift of God in due season*, JSOTSS 225, Sheffield: Sheffield Press, 1996, 65-83, 68.
- Flint, Peter W., *The Dead Sea Psalms Scrolls and the Book of Psalms*, STDJ 17, Leiden/New York/Köln: Brill, 1997.

- Gomez, Luis O., "Art. Buddhist Literature: Exegesis and Hermeneutics," *ER* 2 (1987), 529-540, 529, 533.
- Jain, Eva and Steudel, Annette, "Les manuscrites psalmiques de la Mer Morte et la réception du Psautier à Qumran," *RevSR* 77:4 (2003), 529-543.
- Kim, Angela, "Authorizing interpretation in poetic compositions in the Dead Sea scrolls and later Jewish and Christian traditions," *Dead Sea Discoveries* 10:1 (2003), 26-58, 46; Available from: ATLA Religion Database with ATLA Serials, Ipswich, MA. Accessed September 15, 2010.
- Kim, Euyun-kyu, "Life and Ecological Ideas in Genesis Chapter 1: A View from Taoism and Buddhism," *Madang: Journal of Contextual Theology in East Asia* 1 (2004), 85-112.
- Kim, Jungwoo, "The Qumran Psalms and the Canonical Implications of the Differences in Editorial arrangement of Psalms in 11QPs^a(in Korean)," 「Canon&Culture」 1:2 (2008), 89-120.
- Küster, Volker, "Art. Dialog," *RGG*⁴ 2 (1999), 821.
- Küster, Volker, *A Protestant Theology of Passion: Korean Minjung Theology Revisited*, Leiden: Brill, 2010.
- NAGY, L., "Reconsidering the Issue of the Canon: the Inter-Religious Plurality of Scriptures in Asia and the Intra-Religious Plurality of Psalter Editions (MT, LXX, Qumran)," *Studia Theologia Catholica Latina* 2, Cluj-Napoca: Cluj University Press, 2005, 19-28.
- Pui-lan, Kwok, "Reflection on Women's Sacred Scriptures," *Concilium* 3 (1998), 105-112, 109.
- Pui-lan, Kwok, "Mothers and Daughters. Writers and Fighters," Letty M. Russell, et. al., eds., *Inheriting our Mother's Gardens: Feminist Theology in Third World Perspective*, Philadelphia: Westminster, 1988, 21-34, 29-30.
- Pui-lan, Kwok, "The Feminist Hermeneutics of Elisabeth Schuessler Fiorenza: An Asian Feminist Response," *EJOT* 3 (1985), 147-153, 148.
- Pui-lan, Kwok, *Discovering the Bible in the Non-Biblical World*, Maryknoll: Orbis,

1995.

Pui-lan, Kwok, *Postcolonial Imagination and Feminist Theology*, Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005.

Sanders, James, "Art. Canon," *ABD* I, London/New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992, 839.

Sanders, James, "The Qumran Psalms Scroll (11QPs^a)," *Discoveries in the Judaean Desert of Jordan* 4, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1965.

Sheppard, Gerald T., "Art. Canon," *ER* 3 (1987), 62-69, 64-65.

Talmon, Shemaryahu, "Pisqah Be'emsa 'Pasuq and 11QPs^a," *Textus* 5 (1966), 11-21.

Tov, Emanuel, "The Contribution of the Different Groups of Biblical Dead Sea Scrolls to Exegesis," 「Canon&Culture」 1:2 (2008), 11-39.

Tov, Emanuel, "The Writing of Ancient Biblical Texts, with Special Attention to the Judean Desert Scrolls," Chaim Cohen, et al., eds., *Sefer Moshe: The Moshe Weinfeld Jubilee Volume*, Winona Lake/Indiana: Eisenbrauns 2004, 445-458, 455.

Ulrich, Eugen, *The Dead Sea Scrolls and the Origins of the Bible*, Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999.

Wilson, Gerald H., "The Qumran Scroll Reconsidered: Analysis of the Debate," *CBQ* 47 (1985), 624-642, 630.

Zenger, Erich, "Der Psalter im Horizont von Tora und Prophetie. Kanongeschichtliche und kanonhermeneutische Perspektiven," Jean Marie Auwers and Henk Jan de Jonge, eds., *The Biblical Canons*, Leuven: Peeters, 2003, 111-134.

<초록>

아시아 종교들에 있어서 경전 개념의 다양성과 초기 유대교에서 시편 판본들의 다양성에 대한 비교 연구와 그 해석적 함의

도로테아 에벨레 퀴스터
(브뤼셀 개혁신학대학교 교수)

우리는 이 글에서 최근 학계의 큰 관심을 끌고 있는 정경론에 관한 토론을 새로운 관점에서 다루어 보고자 한다. 우리가 본고에서 말하는 새로운 관점은 서로 다른 학문적 영역을 이루고 있는 아시아 종교에서의 다양한 경전 개념과 초기 유대교에서의 다양한 시편의 판본들에서 형성하여 보았다. 먼저 아시아의 여러 종교들에서 제시되고 있는 다양한 경전 개념은 중국계의 디아스포라 학자인 콰패란의 해석적 모델을 통하여 소개될 것이다. 그는 기독교 경전인 성경을 아시아의 다 경전적 맥락에서 이해해 보려는 시도를 하였다. 이어서 우리는 초기 유대교가 형성될 시점에 시편의 판본들이 다양한 정경적 전통으로 형성되고 있었음을 보고자 하였다. 구체적으로 그 당시 시편은 마소라의 전신을 이루는 본문과 70인역과 콤란에서 발견된 시편 두루마리(11QPs^a)에서 상당한 차이를 보이고 있으므로, 우리는 아시아의 다 경전적 맥락에서 시편의 다 정경적 현상을 비추어 보고자 한다.

<Abstract>

The Inter-Religious Plurality of Scriptures in Asia and the Intra-Religious Plurality of Psalter Editions in Early Judaism

prof., Dorothea Erbele-Küster
(The Faculty of Protestant Theology in Brussels)

Recent insights on the issue of canon from two divergent scholarly fields in biblical studies will be presented and brought into dialogue in this article. The Chinese Diaspora scholar Kwok Pui-lan develops a hermeneutical model which tries to understand the canon of the Christians, the Bible, within the multi-scriptural context of Asia. This inter-religious plurality of scriptures will be highlighted against the backdrop of the Intra-Religious plurality of Psalter editions at the turn of the era, such as the pre-masoretic text, the Septuagint, and the Psalm scroll 11QPs^a found in Qumran.